

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Introduction: Three Separate Inquiries	1
§ 1 Relevant Constitutional and Statutory Provisions	3
§ 1.1 Federal	3
§ 1.2 Arizona	3
§ 2 Preliminary Considerations	5
§ 2.1 Burdens of Proof & Prima Facie Requirement	5
§ 2.2 <i>Miranda</i> and Voluntariness Principles Apply to “Testimonial” Evidence....	6
§ 2.2.1 Physical Characteristics and Non-Testimonial Acts	8
a. General Rule.....	8
b. Examples.....	8
c. Petitions and Court Orders for Physical Characteristics.....	9
§ 2.2.2 Unlocking Electronic Devices Using Physical Characteristics	10
§ 2.2.3 Consent to Search Is Non-Testimonial.....	11
§ 2.2.4 Defendant’s Act of Production	11
§ 2.2.5 No Privacy in Overheard Hospital Room Conversation	12
§ 2.3 Law Enforcement Action Required	13
§ 2.3.1 General Rule.....	13
§ 2.3.2 School Officials & Questioning at School.....	13
a. Related Issue: Child’s Statement to Teacher Not Testimonial.....	14
§ 2.3.3 Child Protective Services (CPS) Employees.....	14
§ 2.3.4 Military Investigators.....	14
§ 2.3.5 Private Security Guard	14
§ 2.3.6 Medical Personnel.....	14
§ 2.3.7 Family Members	15
§ 2.3.8 Mental Health Professionals	15
§ 2.3.9 Undercover Agents.....	15
§ 2.3.10 Probation/Parole Officers	15
§ 2.4 Is Statement Being Offered at Defendant’s Criminal Trial?	15
§ 2.4.1 General Rule.....	15
§ 2.4.2 Examples Where Fifth Amendment Does Not Apply.....	16
a. Grand Jury Proceedings	16
b. Civil Deportation Hearings.....	16

TABLE OF CONTENTS

c. Civil Proceedings/Sexually Violent Predator (SVP) Hearings	16
d. Probation, Supervised Release, and Parole Hearings	16
e. Drug Court	17
§ 2.5 Statements During Mental Health Examination	17
§ 2.6 Suppression of Statements, Not Physical Evidence	19
§ 2.7 Defendant Compelling Witness to Testify	19
§ 2.8 Use Immunity–Co-Extensive with Fifth Amendment	19
§ 3 Custodial Interrogation – <i>Miranda</i> Warnings Requirement	21
§ 3.1 <i>Miranda</i> Warnings Required Only When Suspect Is Subject to “Custodial Interrogation”	21
§ 3.2 No “Anticipatory Invocation” Permitted	21
§ 3.2.1 General Rule	21
§ 3.2.2 Cases	21
§ 3.3 <i>Miranda</i> Rights May Not Be Vicariously Invoked	22
§ 3.4 Break in Custody	23
§ 3.4.1 General Rule	23
§ 3.4.2 14-Day Rule	23
§ 3.5 Recording or Videotaping Interrogations	24
§ 4 Exceptions to the <i>Miranda</i> Rule	27
§ 4.1 Booking Questions (Biographical Information)	27
§ 4.1.1 General Rule	27
§ 4.1.2 Immigration Questioning	27
§ 4.2 Spontaneous Statements	28
§ 4.3 Public Safety Exception and Rescue Doctrine	29
§ 4.3.1 General Rule	29
§ 4.3.2 Cases	29
a. Public Safety Exception	29
b. Rescue Doctrine	30
§ 4.4 Undercover Agents and Incarcerated Defendants	31
§ 4.4.1 Does <i>Miranda</i> Apply?	31
§ 4.4.2 Sixth Amendment (See also § 12)	30
§ 4.4.3 Statements to “Jailhouse Representative”	33
§ 4.5 Probation and Parole (Custody/Interrogation Issues)	34
§ 4.5.1 General Rule	34
§ 5 <i>Miranda</i> Custody	37
§ 5.1 General Rule	37

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 5.2 Ordinarily Non-Custodial Situations	41
§ 5.2.1 Questioning at Home.....	41
a. General Rule	41
b. Cases	41
§ 5.2.2 Questioning While Voluntarily at Police Station or Voluntarily Being Transported	43
a. General Rule	43
b. Cases	43
§ 5.2.3 Traffic Stops	45
§ 5.2.4 Immigration Field Encounters	47
§ 5.2.5 Fleeing from Law Enforcement.....	48
§ 5.2.6 Curbside Questioning at Crime Scene.....	48
§ 5.2.7 Questioning at Hospital.....	49
§ 5.2.8 Prison Inmates	50
§ 5.3 Examples of Custody	51
§ 5.4 Physical Restraints	52
§ 5.4.1 General Rule.....	52
 § 6 Miranda Interrogation	55
§ 6.1 What Constitutes Interrogation?	55
§ 6.2 Cases	55
§ 6.2.1 Cases Finding Interrogation Occurred.....	55
§ 6.2.2 Cases Finding No Interrogation Occurred.....	56
§ 6.3 Recording or Listening to Conversation.....	58
§ 6.4 See also “Booking Questions” (§ 4.1), “Spontaneous Statements” (§ 4.2), “Public Safety” (§ 4.3), and “Undercover Agents and Incarcerated Defendants” (§ 4.4)	58
§ 6.5 DUI (See § 10 “Special Situations – DUI”)	58
 § 7 Admonishment	59
§ 7.1 The <i>Miranda</i> Warnings	59
§ 7.2 Adequacy of Warnings/Repeated Warnings	59
§ 7.2.1 Adequacy of <i>Miranda</i> Warnings.....	59
a. General Rule.....	59
b. Cases	60
§ 7.2.2 Repeated Warnings.....	63
§ 7.3 Mid-Confession Admonishment.....	63
§ 7.4 “Tribal <i>Miranda</i> ” Warnings / Conflicting Administrative Advisements.....	64

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 7.4.1 “Tribal <i>Miranda</i> ”	64
§ 7.4.2 Administrative Warnings – Immigration.....	65
§ 7.5 Consular Notification – Foreign Nationals.....	66
§ 8 Waiver of <i>Miranda</i> Rights	67
§ 8.1 What Constitutes Waiver of the Right to Silence or Counsel?	67
§ 8.1.1 General Rule	67
§ 8.1.2 Cases	68
§ 8.2 Competency to Waive – The Voluntary, Knowing and Intelligent Requirement.....	69
§ 8.2.1 General Rule	69
§ 8.2.2 History of Previous Arrests or Law Enforcement Contacts	69
§ 8.2.3 Lack of Education.....	70
§ 8.2.4 Lack of English Proficiency/Cultural Differences	70
§ 8.2.5 Mental/Psychological Issues, Physical Pain, or Medication.....	72
§ 8.2.6 Intoxication or Drugs.....	73
§ 8.3 Statements Made During Mental Health Examination (See § 2.5).....	74
§ 9 Invocations of <i>Miranda</i> Rights & Reinitiations	75
§ 9.1 General Rule.....	75
§ 9.2 Right to Remain Silent.....	76
§ 9.2.1 General Rule	76
§ 9.2.2 Cases.....	77
§ 9.3 Right to Counsel.....	81
§ 9.3.1 General Rule	81
§ 9.3.2 Cases.....	82
§ 9.4 Ambiguous Invocations (Equivocal Requests for Counsel or Silence)	85
§ 9.4.1 Invocation of Right to Counsel	85
a. General Rule.....	88
b. Cases (Ambiguous Invocation v. Clear Invocation).....	86
§ 9.4.2 Invocation of Right to Silence	88
a. General Rule.....	88
b. Cases (Ambiguous vs. Clear).....	89
§ 9.5 Limited Invocations	91
§ 9.6 Suspect May Reinitiate Questioning.....	92
§ 9.6.1 General Rule	92
§ 9.6.2 Cases.....	92

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 9.7 Break in Custody (see § 3.4)	93
§ 10 Special Situations	95
§ 10.1 Juvenile Defendants	95
§ 10.1.1 Juveniles - <i>Miranda</i> & Voluntariness	95
a. General Rule	95
b. Cases – <i>Miranda</i> Issues	96
c. Cases – Voluntariness Generally	98
§ 10.1.2 Interviews of Children at School (See § 2.3.2)	99
§ 10.1.3 Waiver of Appointed Counsel	99
§ 10.1.4 Effect of Initial Incompetency Determination	99
§ 10.1.5 Federal Cases – Additional Considerations	100
§ 10.1.6 Standard of Review on Appeal	100
§ 10.2 DUI: Field Sobriety Tests, Other Testing, and Right to Counsel Generally	100
§ 10.2.1 Field Sobriety Tests and Other Testing	100
§ 10.2.2 Right to Counsel/Interference with Right to Counsel	101
a. General Rule	101
b. Cases	102
§ 10.3 Employees	104
§ 10.3.1 General Rule	104
§ 10.3.2 Cases	104
§ 10.4 Incarcerated Defendants	105
§ 10.5 Federal Defendants – “McNabb/Mallory” Rule (Six-Hour Rule)	105
§ 11 Voluntariness Under Due Process Clause of Fourteenth Amendment	107
§ 11.1 General Rule	107
§ 11.2 Sua Sponte Voluntariness Hearing	108
§ 11.3 Threats, Promises, and Other Forms of Coercion	109
§ 11.3.1 General Rule	109
§ 11.3.2 Threats	110
a. Telling Suspect His Life Is in Jeopardy	110
b. Relationships/Telling Suspect He or Relative Will Go to Jail (or Children Will Be Removed)	110
c. Discussing Death Penalty	112
d. Advising Defendant Accomplice Implicated Him	112
§ 11.3.3 Promises	113
a. General Rule	113

TABLE OF CONTENTS

b. Cases	114
c. Advising Suspect to Tell the Truth	116
d. Promises of Leniency or Promise to Advise Prosecutor.....	118
e. Telling Defendant Statements Will Not Be Used Against Him....	119
§ 11.4 Other Coercion Issues or Factors	120
§ 11.4.1 Physical Coercion.....	121
§ 11.4.2 Deprivation of Food, Water or Sleep	122
§ 11.4.3 Lack of Clothing.....	123
§ 11.4.4 Deception and Trickery by Officers	123
§ 11.4.5 Religion.....	125
§ 11.4.6 Cultural Background & Language Issues	125
§ 11.4.7 Educational Background and Intelligence	127
§ 11.4.8 Knowledge of Criminal Justice System	127
§ 11.4.9 Mental Issues/Youth of Suspect	128
§ 11.4.10 Intoxication, Drugs, and Medication.....	129
§ 11.4.11 Free Talks.....	132
§ 12 Sixth Amendment Right to Counsel.....	133
§ 12.1 General Rule	133
§ 12.2 Effect of Sixth Amendment Right to Counsel.....	134
§ 12.3 Waiver of Sixth Amendment Right to Counsel	135
§ 12.4 Test for “Unrelated Offense”	136
§ 12.5 Different Proceedings or Situations.....	136
§ 12.5.1 Civil Proceedings.....	136
§ 12.5.2 Tribal Proceedings	136
§ 12.5.3 Petitions for Physical Characteristics or Warrants.....	137
§ 12.5.4 Other.....	137
§ 12.6 Defendant Compelling Witness to Testify.....	137
§ 12.7 Use Immunity – Co-Extensive with Fifth Amendment	138
§ 12.8 Other Cases	138
§ 12.9 DUI Cases – Right to Counsel (See § 10.2).....	138
§ 13 Federal Presentment Delay Issues, <i>McNabb-Mallory</i>, and 18 U.S.C. § 3501 (“Six Hour Rule”)	139
§ 13.1 General Rule	139
§ 13.2 Cases.....	140

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 14 Subsequent Statements and Derivative Physical Evidence	143
§ 14.1 Admissibility of Subsequent Statement when First Statement Is Obtained in Violation of <i>Miranda</i> or is Involuntary.....	143
§ 14.1.1 General Rule.....	143
§ 14.1.2 Cases	144
§ 14.2 <i>Miranda</i> Violation – No Suppression of Physical Fruits.....	147
§ 14.3 Admissibility of Confession Subsequent To Illegal Arrest or Search	148
§ 14.4 Civil – Effect of Failure to Give <i>Miranda</i> Warnings.....	149
§ 15 Trial Issues	151
§ 15.1 Defendant’s Statement Need Not Be a “Confession”; It Only Needs To Be a “Statement”	151
§ 15.2 Defendant’s Self-Serving Hearsay.....	151
§ 15.3 Impeachment of Defendant.....	152
§ 15.3.1 Statements Violating <i>Miranda</i>	152
§ 15.3.2 Statements Violating Sixth Amendment Right to Counsel.....	152
§ 15.4 Commenting on Defendant’s Failure to Testify or Produce Evidence ...	153
§ 15.4.1 Commenting on Failure to Testify.....	153
§ 15.4.2 Commenting on Defendant’s Subpoena Power or Failure to Produce Exculpatory Evidence.....	154
§ 15.5 Commenting on Defendant’s Courtroom Demeanor	156
§ 15.6 Commenting on Defendant’s Silence or Demeanor.....	157
§ 15.6.1 Commenting on Defendant’s Post-Arrest, Post- <i>Miranda</i> Silence....	157
§ 15.6.2 Commenting on Pre-Arrest Silence.....	159
§ 15.6.3 Commenting on Post-Arrest, Pre- <i>Miranda</i> Silence/Demeanor.....	161
§ 15.6.4 Statements Made After Waiving <i>Miranda</i> Rights	163
§ 15.6.5 Eliciting Testimony That Defendant Received <i>Miranda</i> Warnings (But Not That He Invoked).....	164
§ 15.6.6 Defendant’s Silence in Response to Some Questions and Not Others During Interrogation.....	164
§ 15.6.7 Penalty Phase – Comments re Defendant’s Allocution	164
§ 15.7 Co-Defendant’s Statements (<i>Bruton</i> Issues).....	165
§ 15.8 Refusal to Answer Questions During Presentence Interview	166
§ 16 Appeal	167
§ 16.1 Appeal of a Suppression Order by Prosecution	167
§ 16.1.1 Arizona	167
§ 16.1.2 Federal	167
§ 16.2 Appeal by Defendant	168

TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 16.2.1 Arizona	168
§ 16.2.2 Federal.....	168
§ 16.3 Standard of Review	168
§ 16.4 Waiver by Defendant If He Does Not Testify or Mootness Because Statement Not Admitted.....	168
§ 16.5 Harmless Error & Fundamental Error	169
Tips for Motions to Suppress Statements and Responses	171
Table of Cases	173