

CHAPTER 10

EMPLOYMENT LITIGATION

Chapter Editor: John Alan Doran

ARTICLE 10.1

THE ATTORNEY-CLIENT RELATIONSHIP

§ 10.1.1	This Article's Scope	10.1-1
§ 10.1.2	Overview	10.1-1
§ 10.1.3	Fee Agreements.....	10.1-2
§ 10.1.3.1	General Requirements.....	10.1-2
§ 10.1.3.2	Different Types of Fee Agreements.....	10.1-3
§ 10.1.3.2.1	Hourly Fee Agreements	10.1-3
§ 10.1.3.2.2	Contingency Fees Agreements.....	10.1-3
§ 10.1.3.2.3	Hybrid Agreements.....	10.1-3
§ 10.1.3.3	Reasonableness of Attorneys' Fees	10.1-4
§ 10.1.3.4	Declining Representation.....	10.1-5
§ 10.1.4	Communications between Attorneys and Clients.....	10.1-6
§ 10.1.4.1	The Attorney-Client Privilege	10.1-6
§ 10.1.4.2	Purposes of the Attorney-Client Privilege	10.1-7
§ 10.1.4.3	Scope of the Privilege.....	10.1-7
§ 10.1.4.4	Elements of the Privilege.....	10.1-8
§ 10.1.4.5	Waiver of the Attorney-Client Privilege	10.1-10
§ 10.1.4.6	Inadvertent Disclosure.....	10.1-11
§ 10.1.4.7	The Corporate Client's Attorney-Client Privilege.....	10.1-13
§ 10.1.4.8	Who Asserts the Corporate Privilege.....	10.1-14
§ 10.1.4.9	<i>Ex Parte</i> Contact with Corporate Employees.....	10.1-15
§ 10.1.4.10	Attorney-Client Privilege Between Multiple Clients.....	10.1-16
§ 10.1.4.11	The Common Interest Rule: Multiple Parties and Multiple Attorneys	10.1-16
§ 10.1.5	Conflicts of Interest.....	10.1-17
§ 10.1.5.1	Multiple Plaintiffs.....	10.1-20
§ 10.1.5.2	Multiple Defendants	10.1-20
§ 10.1.6	Other Sources	10.1-22

ARTICLE 10.2
REMOVAL OF CASES TO FEDERAL COURT

§ 10.2.1	The Article’s Scope	10.2-1
§ 10.2.2	Overview	10.2-1
§ 10.2.3	Statute of Limitations	10.2-3
§ 10.2.4	Introduction	10.2-4
§ 10.2.5	Process of Removal	10.2-5
§ 10.2.6	Removal Jurisdiction.....	10.2-7
§ 10.2.6.1	Federal Question	10.2-8
§ 10.2.6.2	Diversity of Citizenship.....	10.2-9
§ 10.2.6.3	“Class Action” Diversity	10.2-11
§ 10.2.7	Procedure Following Removal.....	10.2-13
§ 10.2.8	Remand.....	10.2-13
§ 10.2.9	Other Sources	10.2-15

ARTICLE 10.3
DISCOVERY

§ 10.3.1	This Article’s Scope	10.3-1
§ 10.3.2	Overview	10.3-1
§ 10.3.3	Timing of Discovery.....	10.3-1
§ 10.3.4	General Discovery Considerations.....	10.3-2
§ 10.3.4.1	Discovery of Circumstantial Evidence	10.3-2
§ 10.3.4.2	The Impact of Initial Disclosures on Discovery Strategy.....	10.3-4
§ 10.3.4.3	Informal Discovery and Use of Administrative Hearings	10.3-5
§ 10.3.4.4	Certification by Client and Client Review of and Participation in Discovery.....	10.3-6
§ 10.3.4.5	Drafting Formal Discovery Requests.....	10.3-7
§ 10.3.4.6	Electronically Stored Information	10.3-7
§ 10.3.4.7	Supplementation of Discovery.....	10.3-8
§ 10.3.5	Mandatory Disclosure Rules.....	10.3-8
§ 10.3.5.1	Good Cause and Sanctions for Failure to Comply	10.3-9
§ 10.3.5.2	Rule 37 Standards and Sanctions	10.3-11
§ 10.3.5.3	Privileged and Trial Preparation Materials	10.3-13
§ 10.3.5.4	Examples of Sanctions and Exclusions of Evidence.....	10.3-13
§ 10.3.5.5	Federal Disclosure Requirements	10.3-20
§ 10.3.6	Depositions	10.3-21

CHAPTER 10 – TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 10.3.6.1	General Considerations in Depositions.....	10.3-21
§ 10.3.6.2	Plaintiff's Strategies in Depositions.....	10.3-23
§ 10.3.6.3	Defendant's Strategies in Depositions.....	10.3-25
§ 10.3.7	Interrogatories	10.3-28
§ 10.3.7.1	General Considerations in Interrogatories.....	10.3-28
§ 10.3.7.2	Plaintiff's Strategies in Interrogatories.....	10.3-29
§ 10.3.7.3	Defendant's Strategies in Interrogatories	10.3-31
§ 10.3.8	Requests for Production	10.3-31
§ 10.3.8.1	General Considerations in Requests for Production.....	10.3-31
§ 10.3.8.2	Plaintiff's Strategies in Requests for Production.....	10.3-31
§ 10.3.8.3	Defendant's Strategies in Requests for Production	10.3-33
§ 10.3.9	Requests for Admission	10.3-35
§ 10.3.10	Interviews and ER 4.2	10.3-35
§ 10.3.10.1	This Section's Scope.....	10.3-35
§ 10.3.10.2	Introduction.....	10.3-35
§ 10.3.10.3	Ethical Rule 4.2	10.3-36
§ 10.3.10.4	Current Employees.....	10.3-37
§ 10.3.10.5	Former Employees	10.3-37
§ 10.3.10.6	Attorney-Client Privilege	10.3-38
§ 10.3.11	Other Sources	10.3-39

ARTICLE 10.4 MOTION PRACTICE

§ 10.4.1	This Article's Scope	10.4-1
§ 10.4.2	Overview	10.4-1
§ 10.4.3	Time Limitations	10.4-1
§ 10.4.4	Introduction.....	10.4-2
§ 10.4.5	Motions to Dismiss (Rule 12)	10.4-3
§ 10.4.6	Motions for Summary Judgment or Partial Summary Judgment (Rule 56)	10.4-4
§ 10.4.6.1	Defining Principles	10.4-4
§ 10.4.6.2	Facts Viewed in Favor of Nonmoving Party.....	10.4-5
§ 10.4.6.3	All Discovery Must Be "Complete."	10.4-5
§ 10.4.6.4	Reconsideration.....	10.4-5
§ 10.4.6.5	Separate Statement of Facts	10.4-6
§ 10.4.6.6	Memorandum of Points and Authorities	10.4-6
§ 10.4.6.7	Burdens of Proof	10.4-7
§ 10.4.6.8	The Response Memorandum	10.4-12

ARIZONA EMPLOYMENT LAW HANDBOOK

§ 10.4.6.9 The Reply Memorandum.....	10.4-12
§ 10.4.6.10 Partial Findings of Fact Not in Controversy.....	10.4-13
§ 10.4.7 Motions in Limine.....	10.4-13
§ 10.4.8 Other Sources	10.4-14

ARTICLE 10.5 VOIR DIRE AND JURY SELECTION

§ 10.5.1 This Article's Scope	10.5-1
§ 10.5.2 The Goals of Jury Voir Dire.....	10.5-1
§ 10.5.3 Case Analysis.....	10.5-2
§ 10.5.4 Community Attitude Surveys	10.5-2
§ 10.5.5 Mock Trials	10.5-3
§ 10.5.6 Preparing the Voir Dire Examination.....	10.5-3
§ 10.5.7 Conducting the Voir Dire Examination.....	10.5-5
§ 10.5.7.1 Recording Information.....	10.5-5
§ 10.5.7.2 Client Preparation	10.5-5
§ 10.5.7.5 Jury Questionnaires	10.5-7
§ 10.5.8 Challenges to Jurors.....	10.5-8
§ 10.5.8.1 Challenge for Cause.....	10.5-8
§ 10.5.8.2 Peremptory Challenge	10.5-9
§ 10.5.8.3 Challenge to the Array.....	10.5-9
§ 10.5.8.4 Exercising the Challenge for Cause.....	10.5-9
§ 10.5.8.5 Exercising the Peremptory Challenge.....	10.5-10
§ 10.5.8.6 Peremptory Challenges Based on Race and Sex.....	10.5-10
§ 10.5.9 Sample Jury Voir Dire Questions	10.5-10

ARTICLE 10.6 LABOR AND EMPLOYMENT LAW JURY INSTRUCTIONS

§ 10.6.1 Introduction and Scope.....	10.6-1
--------------------------------------	--------

ARTICLE 10.7 FORMS OF VERDICT

§ 10.7.1 This Article's Scope	10.7-1
§ 10.7.2 Overview	10.7-1
§ 10.7.3 Time Limitations	10.7-1

CHAPTER 10 – TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 10.7.4	Introduction.....	10.7-1
§ 10.7.5	General Forms of Verdict.....	10.7-2
§ 10.7.6	Special Forms of Verdict and Interrogatories	10.7-3
§ 10.7.7	Combining General Verdicts and Interrogatories.....	10.7-3
§ 10.7.8	Verdict Forms in Employment Trials.....	10.7-4
§ 10.7.9	Juror Signatures	10.7-4
§ 10.7.10	Sample Forms.....	10.7-4
§ 10.7.11	Other Sources	10.7-4

ARTICLE 10.8 FEE APPLICATIONS

§ 10.8.1	This Article’s Scope	10.8-1
§ 10.8.2	Overview	10.8-2
§ 10.8.3	Statute of Limitations	10.8-2
§ 10.8.4	General Bases on Which Fees Can Be Awarded	10.8-2
§ 10.8.5	Applications for Fees and Nontaxable Costs in Federal Court	10.8-4
§ 10.8.5.1	Standards for Awarding Fees in Federal Court	10.8-6
§ 10.8.5.2	Standards under Federal Fee-Shifting Statutes.....	10.8-6
§ 10.8.5.3	Standards in Federal “Common Fund” Cases.....	10.8-11
§ 10.8.6	Applications for Fees in Arizona Superior Court	10.8-12
§ 10.8.6.1	Standards under Arizona Fee-Shifting Statutes.....	10.8-13
§ 10.8.6.2	Standards in Arizona “Common Fund” Cases.....	10.8-17
§ 10.8.7	Effect of Settlement Offers and Offers of Judgment	10.8-18
§ 10.8.8	Other Sources	10.8-19

ARTICLE 10.9 SETTLEMENT

§ 10.9.1	This Article’s Scope	10.9-1
§ 10.9.2	Introduction.....	10.9-1
§ 10.9.3	Enforceability of Releases Relating to Employment Discrimination Claims	10.9-1
§ 10.9.3.1	Consideration.....	10.9-4
§ 10.9.3.2	Duress	10.9-4
§ 10.9.3.3	Ratification of Release.....	10.9-6
§ 10.9.4	The Older Workers’ Benefit Protection Act (OWBPA).....	10.9-8
§ 10.9.5	Arizona Civil Rights Division (ACRD) Negotiated Settlement.....	10.9-10
§ 10.9.6	Consent Decrees	10.9-11

ARIZONA EMPLOYMENT LAW HANDBOOK

§ 10.9.6.1	Consent Decrees in Class Actions.....	10.9-12
§ 10.9.6.2	Modification of Consent Decrees.....	10.9-13
§ 10.9.6.3	Equal Employment Opportunity Commission and Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs (OFCCP) Agreements.....	10.9-13
§ 10.9.7	The Class Action Fairness Act	10.9-14
§ 10.9.8	Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA).....	10.9-14
§ 10.9.9	Family and Medical Leave Act (FMLA)	10.9-16
§ 10.9.10	Authorization to Settle	10.9-17
§ 10.9.11	Attorneys' Fees	10.9-18
§ 10.9.12	Rule 80(d)	10.9-18
§ 10.9.13	Rule 68	10.9-18
§ 10.9.14	Other Sources	10.9-19

ARTICLE 10.10 AFTER-ACQUIRED EVIDENCE

§ 10.10.1	This Article's Scope	10.10-1
§ 10.10.2	Overview	10.10-1
§ 10.10.3	Statute of Limitations	10.10-1
§ 10.10.4	Introduction/Elements of Claim.....	10.10-1
§ 10.10.5	The Supreme Court's Decision in <i>McKennon</i>	10.10-1
§ 10.10.6	The Limits of After-Acquired Evidence after <i>McKennon</i>	10.10-3
§ 10.10.7	Elements of the Defense and Practical Implications.....	10.10-4
§ 10.10.8	Remedies.....	10.10-6
§ 10.10.9	Other Sources	10.10-6

ARTICLE 10.11 CLASS ACTIONS

§ 10.11.1	This Article's Scope.....	10.11-1
§ 10.11.2	Overview.....	10.11-1
§ 10.11.3	Statutes of Limitations.....	10.11-1
§ 10.11.4	Introduction	10.11-1
§ 10.11.5	Identification of Cases Amenable to Class Action Litigation	10.11-4
§ 10.11.5.1	Company Policy Cases.....	10.11-4
§ 10.11.5.2	Employment Discrimination.....	10.11-4
§ 10.11.5.2.1	Disparate Treatment Cases.....	10.11-5

CHAPTER 10 – TABLE OF CONTENTS

§ 10.11.5.2.2	Pattern and Practice Cases.....	10.11-5
§ 10.11.5.2.3	Disparate Impact Cases.....	10.11-6
§ 10.11.5.3	Layoff and Reorganization Cases	10.11-6
§ 10.11.5.4	Plant Closing Cases.....	10.11-6
§ 10.11.5.5	Multiple Plaintiffs.....	10.11-6
§ 10.11.5.6	Employee Benefits Cases.....	10.11-6
§ 10.11.5.7	Cases Based on the Fair Labor Standards Act.....	10.11-7
§ 10.11.5.7.1	Age Discrimination and Equal Pay Act Cases	10.11-7
§ 10.11.5.7.2	Alternative to Avoid the “Opt-In” Problem of FLSA	10.11-7
§ 10.11.5.8	Claims Against Government Employees	10.11-8
§ 10.11.5.9	Other Options for Obtaining Relief	10.11-8
§ 10.11.6	Advantages to Class Action.....	10.11-9
§ 10.11.6.1	Cost Savings.....	10.11-9
§ 10.11.6.2	Consistency	10.11-9
§ 10.11.6.3	Leverage	10.11-10
§ 10.11.6.4	Concerted Activity	10.11-10
§ 10.11.7	Disadvantages to Class Action.....	10.11-10
§ 10.11.7.1	Narrowing of Claims	10.11-10
§ 10.11.7.2	Settlement Problems.....	10.11-11
§ 10.11.7.3	Notice and “Opt-Out” Problems.....	10.11-11
§ 10.11.7.4	Management of Litigation.....	10.11-11
§ 10.11.8	Compliance with Rule 23	10.11-11
§ 10.11.8.1	Numerosity – Identifying and Defining Class.....	10.11-12
§ 10.11.8.2	Commonality – Identifying Common Questions of Law and Fact	10.11-12
§ 10.11.8.3	Typicality – Identifying Representative Parties	10.11-12
§ 10.11.8.4	Adequacy of Representation.....	10.11-13
§ 10.11.8.4.1	Representation by Unincorporated Associations	10.11-13
§ 10.11.8.5	Manageability – Rule 23(b)	10.11-13
§ 10.11.8.6	Certification of Class by Court.....	10.11-14
§ 10.11.8.7	Restrictions, Conditions, and Other Orders	10.11-14
§ 10.11.9	Notice of Class Members.....	10.11-15
§ 10.11.10	Relief Sought.....	10.11-15
§ 10.11.10.1	Declaratory Relief.....	10.11-15
§ 10.11.10.2	Injunctive Relief.....	10.11-16
§ 10.11.10.3	Damages	10.11-16

§ 10.11.10.3.1 Proof.....	10.11-16
§ 10.11.10.3.2 Calculation.....	10.11-17
§ 10.11.10.3.3 Distribution.....	10.11-17
§ 10.11.10.4 Attorneys' Fees and Costs.....	10.11-17
§ 10.11.11 Judgment.....	10.11-18
§ 10.11.12 Settlement.....	10.11-18
§ 10.11.13 Other Sources	10.11-19

ARTICLE 10.12

TAXATION ISSUES IN EMPLOYMENT SETTLEMENT AWARDS

§ 10.12.1 This Article's Scope	10.12-1
§ 10.12.2 General Principles of Federal Income Taxation	10.12-1
§ 10.12.2.1. Scope of Income Subject to Tax.....	10.12-2
§ 10.12.2.2 Payroll Taxes.....	10.12-2
§ 10.12.2.3 Deductions from Income	10.12-2
§ 10.12.2.4 Exclusions from Income; Personal Injuries.....	10.12-3
§ 10.12.2.5 Alternative Minimum Tax.....	10.12-3
§ 10.12.3 Analysis of the Tax Consequences of an Award or Judgment.....	10.12-4
§ 10.12.3.1 Issues for Recipients	10.12-4
§ 10.12.3.1.1 What Payments Are Excludable?.....	10.12-4
§ 10.12.3.1.2 How Should a Settlement Payment Be Allocated? ..	10.12-5
§ 10.12.3.1.3 What Payments Are Treated as Wages?	10.12-6
§ 10.12.3.1.4 When Must Payments Be Included in Income?	10.12-7
§ 10.12.3.1.5 Can Attorneys' Fees and Costs Be Deducted for Tax Purposes?.....	10.12-7
§ 10.12.3.2 Issues for Payors	10.12-9
§ 10.12.3.2.1 Which Payments Are Deductible and When?	10.12-9
§ 10.12.3.2.2 What Withholding and Reporting Requirements Apply?	10.12-10
§ 10.12.4 Allocating Proceeds from Judgments and Settlements	10.12-11
§ 10.12.5 Conclusion.....	10.12-11